

**THE STATES assembled on Monday  
22nd September 2008, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of  
Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye,  
Greffier of the States.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Stuart Syvret – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.)  
Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.24 a.m.)  
Senator Terence John Le Main – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.44 a.m.)  
Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.24 a.m.)  
Connétable John Le Sueur Gallichan of Trinity – en défaut  
Connétable Daniel John Murphy of Grouville – en défaut  
Connétable Graeme Frank Butcher of St. John – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.44 a.m.)  
Deputy Peter Nicholas Troy of St. Brelade – ill  
Deputy Sarah Craig Ferguson of St. Brelade – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.50 a.m.)  
Deputy James Gordon Reed of St. Ouen – ill  
Deputy Patrick John Dennis Ryan of St. Helier – ill  
Deputy Deidre Wendy Mezbourian of St. Lawrence – en défaut  
Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement – en défaut

Prayers read by the Deputy Greffier of the States

**Notification of lodged propositions**

Annual Business Plan 2009 (P.113/2008): fourth amendment (P.113/2008 Amd.(4)) – P.113/2008.  
second amendment. Amd.(4)  
Lodged: 22nd September 2008. Amd.(2)  
*Chief Minister.*

**Draft Annual Business Plan 2009 P.113/2008**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2009 and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers, agreed that in paragraph (b) after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009”, the following words should be inserted –

- (6) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department shall be increased by £4.5 million to provide the necessary funding for the anticipated increase in the cost of supplementation;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 35**

Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf

Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen

**CONTRE: 7**

Senator S. Syvret  
Senator L. Norman  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains  
(C)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
(S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy of St. Mary

### **Change of Presidency**

Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States, retired from the Chair during consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers to paragraph (b) concerning supplementation and the meeting continued under the Presidency of the Bailiff.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers, agreed that in paragraph (b) after the word: “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009”, the following words should be inserted–

- (7) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department shall be increased by £529,000 for the purposes of providing work and vocational day care service opportunities for people with learning disabilities and people on the autistic spectrum;”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 40**

Senator S. Syvret  
Senator L. Norman  
Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement

#### **CONTRE: 1**

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
(S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers, agreed that in paragraph (b) after the word: “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009”, the following words should be inserted–

- (8) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department shall be increased by £2,320,000 to extend transitional relief to October 2009 for those in receipt of protected benefit payments under the income support scheme and to increase the Winter Fuel Allowance in accordance with recent increases in the cost of fuel;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 42**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator L. Norman  
Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)

Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
 (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES, having adopted paragraph (2) of an amendment of Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen to an amendment of the Council of Ministers that in paragraph (b) the words “, with the approval of this expenditure, in accordance with the provisions of Article 14(9) of the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005, dependent upon the subsequent approval by the States of the introduction of a Vehicle Emissions Duty which will generate sufficient income to fund this expenditure” should be deleted, adopted an amendment of the Council of Ministers that in paragraph (b) after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009”, the following words should be inserted–

- (9) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department shall be increased by £1.0 million to fund the first phase of a package of recycling and sustainable transport initiatives,”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 25**

Senator F.H. Walker  
 Senator W. Kinnard  
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator M.E. Vibert  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
  
 Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
 (S)

**CONTRE: 17**

Senator L. Norman  
 Senator J.L. Perchard  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains  
 (C)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier  
 (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy of St. John

Deputy of St. Mary

### **Change of Presidency**

The States re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff.

Following the adoption of paragraph (2) of the amendment of Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen (Annual Business Plan 2009 (P.113/2008): fourth amendment (P.113/2008 Amd.(4))– amendment’ lodged ‘au Greffe’ on 2nd September 2008) the Deputy Bailiff informed the Assembly that paragraph (10) of the amendment of the Council of Ministers to paragraph (b) was deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers, agreed that in paragraph (b) after the word: “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009”, the following words should be inserted–

- (11) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Law Officers’ Department for 2009 shall be increased by £520,000 to ensure there are sufficient resources to restructure the Department in order to meet the pressures on the Department and achieve service levels which are to be agreed with the Council of Ministers;”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 35**

Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator W. Kinnard

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator J.L. Perchard  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
(S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)

#### **CONTRE: 2**

Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains  
(C)

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (b) as amended, approved a revised summary set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table A, page 94, being the gross revenue expenditure of each States funded body and, base on a provision for pay awards of 3.2% for June 2008 and 2.0% for June 2009, totalling £684,200,100 and having taken into account any income due to each of the States funded bodies, the net revenue expenditure of each States funded body totalling £585,942,000 to be withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2009, except that –

the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister's Department should be increased by £570,000 to ensure the range of functions within the Chief Minister's Department required for a modern and responsible government are strengthened and re organised;

the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister's Department should be increased by £200,000 to enable a new post for a Tax Strategist to be created within the Chief Minister's Department to work closely with the Director of International Finance and International Relations officers;

the net revenue expenditure of the Education, Sport and Culture Department should be increased by £552,000 to extend opportunities for children who attain the age of 4 years between 1st September and 31st August in the year before commencing statutory education;

the net revenue expenditure of the Home Affairs Department should be increased by £250,000 to provide the necessary funding for the implementation of the Discrimination (Jersey) Law 200-;

the net revenue expenditure of the Planning and Environment Department should be increased by £1.0 million to fund the first phase of an extensive package of environmental initiatives;

the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department should be increased by £4.5 million to provide the necessary funding for the anticipated increase in the cost of supplementation;

the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department should be increased by £529,000 for the purposes of providing work and vocational day care service opportunities for people with learning disabilities and people on the autistic spectrum;

the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department should be increased by £2,320,000 to extend transitional relief to October 2009 for those in receipt of protected benefit payments under the income support scheme and to increase the Winter Fuel Allowance in accordance with recent increases in the cost of fuel;

the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department should be increased by £1.0 million to fund the first phase of a package of recycling and sustainable transport initiatives; and,

the net revenue expenditure of the Law Officers' Department for 2009 should be increased by £520,000 to ensure there are sufficient resources to restructure the Department in order to meet the pressures on the Department and achieve service levels which are to be agreed with the Council of Ministers.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (c), approved the summary set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table B, page 95, being the estimated income and expenditure and estimated minimum contribution, if any, that each States trading operation was to make to the States consolidated fund in 2009.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (d), approved each of the capital projects in the recommended programme of capital projects for each States funded body for 2009, as set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table D page 97, that required £54,851,000 to be withdrawn from the consolidated fund.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (e), approved each of the capital projects in the recommended programme of capital for each States trading operation, as set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table E, page 98, the required funds to be drawn from the trading funds in 2009.

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers that in paragraph (f) after the words "Summary Table C, page 98, the following words should be inserted –

- (1) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister’s Department shall be increased in 2010 by £584,000, in 2011 by £599,000, in 2012 by £614,000 and in 2013 by £629,000 to ensure the range of functions within the Chief Minister’s Department required for a modern and responsible government are strengthened and re organised;”
- (2) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister’s Department shall be increased in 2010 by £205,000, in 2011 by £210,000, in 2012 by £215,000 and in 2013 by £220,000 to enable a new post for a Tax Strategist to be created within the Chief Minister’s Department to work closely with the Director of International Finance and International Relations officers;”
- (3) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Education, Sport and Culture Department shall be increased in 2010 by £1,498,000, in 2011 by £1,657,000, in 2012 by £1,639,000 and in 2013 by £1,679,000 to extend opportunities for children who attain the age of 4 years between 1st September and 31st August in the year before commencing statutory education, to access free education, 20 hours per week during term time;”
- (4) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Home Affairs Department shall be increased in 2010 by £256,000, in 2011 by £263,000 in 2012 by £269,000 and in 2013 by £276,000 to provide the necessary funding for the implementation of the Discrimination (Jersey) Law 200-;”
- (5) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Planning and Environment Department shall be increased in 2010 by £2.0 million, in 2011 by £2.5 million, in 2012 by £2.65 million and in 2013 by £2.65 million to fund further phases of the extensive package of environmental initiative: providing that a new Vehicle Emissions Duty is approved by the States in 2008 to fund this expenditure;”
- (6) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department shall be increased in 2010 by £842,000, in 2011 by £863,000, in 2012 by £884,000 and in 2013 by £906,000 for the purposes of providing work and vocational day care service opportunities for people with learning disabilities and people on the autistic spectrum ;”
- (7) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department shall be increased in 2010 by £2,056,000, in 2011 by £1,111,000, in 2012 by £716,000 and in 2013 by £351,000 to extend the phasing out of transitional relief, starting from October 2009, for those in receipt of protected benefit payments under income support and to increase the Winter Fuel Allowance in accordance with recent increases in the cost of fuel;”
- (8) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department shall be increased in 2010 by £1.752 million in 2011 by £2.5 million, in 2012 by £2.5 million and in 2013 by £2.5 million to fund further phases of the package of Recycling and Sustainable Transport initiatives providing that a new Vehicle Emissions Duty is approved by the States in 2008 to fund this expenditure;”
- (9) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be increased in 2010 by £308,000, in 2011 by £315,000, in 2012 by £323,000 and in 2013 by £331,000 to meet the additional costs associated with administering GST zero-rating;”
- (10) “, except that the net revenue expenditure of the Law Officers’ Department shall be increased in 2010 by £533,000, in 2011 by £546,000, in 2012 by £560,000, in 2013 by £574,000 to ensure there are sufficient resources to restructure the Department in order to meet the pressures on the Department and achieve service levels which are to be agreed with the Council of Ministers;”

THE STATES, in accordance with Article 11(5) of the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005, acceded to the request of the Chief Minister that his amendment to the draft Annual Business Plan 2008 (Annual Business Plan 2008 (P.113/2008): fourth amendment (P.113/2008 Amd. (4)) – second amendment lodged ‘au Greffe’ on 22nd September 2008) be considered as an item of business at the present meeting.

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Chief Minister to the Council of Ministers' amendments to paragraph (f), agreed that in (5) for the words "providing that a new Vehicle Emissions Duty is approved by the States in 2008 to fund this expenditure" there should be substituted the words "providing that a new Environmental Tax is approved by the States in 2009, following further public consultation, to fund this expenditure" and in (8) for the words "providing that a new Vehicle Emissions Duty is approved by the States in 2008 to fund this expenditure" there should be substituted the words "providing that a new Environmental Tax is approved by the States in 2009, following further public consultation, to fund this expenditure".

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 26**

Senator F.H. Walker  
 Senator W. Kinnard  
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
  
 Senator M.E. Vibert  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
 (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary

**CONTRE: 7**

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains  
 (C)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Following the adoption of the amendment of the Chief Minister to the Council of Ministers' amendment (8) of paragraph (f), the Deputy Bailiff informed the Assembly that paragraphs (3) and (4) of the amendment of Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen ('Annual Business Plan 2009 (P.113/2008): fourth amendment (P.113/2008 Amd.(4))– amendment' lodged 'au Greffe on 2nd September 2008) were deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (f), as amended, approved in principle the total net revenue expenditure for the States-funded bodies, as set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table C, page 96, except that–

- (1) the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister's Department should be increased in 2010 by £584,000, in 2011 by £599,000, in 2012 by £614,000 and in 2013 by £629,000 to ensure the range of functions within the Chief Minister's Department required for a modern and responsible government are strengthened and re organised;
- (2) the net revenue expenditure of the Chief Minister's Department should be increased in 2010 by £205,000, in 2011 by £210,000, in 2012 by £215,000 and in 2013 by £220,000 to enable a new post



for a Tax Strategist to be created within the Chief Minister's Department to work closely with the Director of International Finance and International Relations officers;

- (3) the net revenue expenditure of the Education, Sport and Culture Department should be increased in 2010 by £1,498,000, in 2011 by £1,657,000, in 2012 by £1,639,000 and in 2013 by £1,679,000 to extend opportunities for children who attained the age of 4 years between 1st September and 31st August in the year before commencing statutory education, to access free education, 20 hours per week during term time;
- (4) the net revenue expenditure of the Home Affairs Department should be increased in 2010 by £256,000, in 2011 by £263,000 in 2012 by £269,000 and in 2013 by £276,000 to provide the necessary funding for the implementation of the Discrimination (Jersey) Law 200-;
- (5) the net revenue expenditure of the Planning and Environment Department should be increased in 2010 by £2.0 million, in 2011 by £2.5 million, in 2012 by £2.65 million and in 2013 by £2.65 million to fund further phases of the extensive package of environmental initiatives providing that a new Environmental Tax is approved by the States in 2009, following further public consultation, to fund this expenditure;
- (6) the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department should be increased in 2010 by £842,000, in 2011 by £863,000, in 2012 by £884,000 and in 2013 by £906,000 for the purposes of providing work and vocational day care service opportunities for people with learning disabilities and people on the autistic spectrum;
- (7) the net revenue expenditure of the Social Security Department should be increased in 2010 by £2,056,000, in 2011 by £1,111,000, in 2012 by £716,000 and in 2013 by £351,000 to extend the phasing out of transitional relief, starting from October 2009, for those in receipt of protected benefit payments under income support and to increase the Winter Fuel Allowance in accordance with recent increases in the cost of fuel;
- (8) the net revenue expenditure of the Transport and Technical Services Department should be increased in 2010 by £1.752 million in 2011 by £2.5 million, in 2012 by £2.5 million and in 2013 by £2.5 million to fund further phases of the package of Recycling and Sustainable Transport initiatives providing that a new Environmental Tax is approved by the States in 2009, following further public consultation, to fund this expenditure;
- (9) the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department should be increased in 2010 by £308,000, in 2011 by £315,000, in 2012 by £323,000 and in 2013 by £331,000 to meet the additional costs associated with administering GST zero-rating;
- (10) the net revenue expenditure of the Law Officers' Department should be increased in 2010 by £533,000, in 2011 by £546,000, in 2012 by £560,000, in 2013 by £574,000 to ensure there would be sufficient resources to restructure the Department in order to meet the pressures on the Department and achieve service levels which would be agreed with the Council of Ministers;

for the period 2010 to 2013 and the proposed programme of capital projects for the States funded bodies for 2010 to 2013 as set out in Part Three of the report, Summary Table F, page 99; and requested the Chief Minister to present Annual Business Plans to the States within these amounts, with any additional growth in the net revenue expenditure of a States funded body being offset by compensatory savings elsewhere within the total amounts.

THE STATES, having acceded to the request of the Chief Minister, in accordance with Standing Order 26(8), to delete the words 'Highbury House' from the list of properties for disposal in 2009, adopted paragraph (g), and approved the schedule of properties for disposal in 2009 in the property plan, as detailed in Part Three of the report, Summary Table G, pages 100 to 101 of the report.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 36**

Senator L. Norman  
Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator W. Kinnard

**CONTRE: 2**

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains  
(C)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator F.E. Cohen

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator M.E. Vibert  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
 (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Chief Minister that the Assembly continue the meeting to conclude its consideration of the draft Annual Business Plan 2009.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator F.H. Walker  
 Senator W. Kinnard  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator M.E. Vibert  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier  
 (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)

**CONTRE: 25**

Senator L. Norman  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren  
 (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy A.J.D. Maclean (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy of St. Mary

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Tuesday 23rd September 2008 to continue consideration of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2009 (P.113/2008) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.42 p.m.

**A.H. HARRIS**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*